EXHIBIT 12



From: Legal legal@acgme.org @

Subject: RE: IMG

Date: July 11, 2018 at 11:00 AM

To: Amro Ali amro.ali9@icloud.com, Legal legal@acgme.org

Please review the program requirements. With the exception of the eligibility requirements, the ACGME has no requirements regarding the timing of the step 3 exam. If a program is treating IMGs and AMGs differently, that *may* fall under the requirement regarding policies to prevent harassment.

Again, I think the best resource for you will be the Ombudsperson. Please see the links below for contact information.

Teri E. Robins, JD, MBA

Senior Attorney

Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education 401North Michigan Avenue, Suite 2000

> Chicago, IL 60611 Office: 312-755-5000 Direct: 312-755-7080 TRobins@acgme.org



From: Amro Ali <amro.ali9@icloud.com> Sent: Tuesday, July 10, 2018 5:45 PM

To: Legal < legal@acgme.org>

Subject: Re: IMG

Thanks for your kind reply.

I have a simple question, does any program have the right to ask for step 3 to start because he is IMG and allows AMG to start without the same request.

Especially if the contract doesn't denotes that.

Α

On Jul 10, 2018, at 6:00 PM, Legal < legal@acgme.org > wrote:

Please review the Institutional Requirements and the Common Program Requirements which outline eligibility which can be found here http://www.acgme.org/Portals/0/PFAssets/InstitutionalRequirements/000InstitutionalRequirements2018.pdf?ver=2018-02-19-132236-600 and here http://www.acgme.org/Portals/0/PFAssets/ProgramRequirements/CPRs 2017-07-01.pdf. The Institutional Requirements also includes a requirement requiring the institution to have a policy preventing harassment.

If you feel that your program has not complied with the requirements, you can report an issue as described on this page http://www.acgme.org/Residents-and-Fellows/Report-an-Issue.

I think your best resource will be the Office of the Ombudsperson or the Office of Complaints, but if I can be of further assistance, please do not hesitate to reach out.

Teri E. Robins, JD, MBA Senior Attorney

Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education <image003.jpg>401 North Michigan Avenue, Suite 2000 Chicago, IL 60611

Office: 312-755-5000 Direct: 312-755-7080 TRobins@acgme.org

----Original Message-----

From: Amro Ali <amro.ali9@icloud.com> Sent: Tuesday, July 10, 2018 4:04 PM

To: Legal < legal@acgme.org>

Subject: IMG

Dear Madam/Sir,

I am IMG who applied for residency Program in NYC, I have been asked to pass step 3 before I start my PGY2 although institute contract posted online denoted that I can take the exam during my PGY2.

When I asked FSMB, the denoted that step 3 only for licensure and not for starting residency, Head of GME and Program director made mentioned this contract rules fits only for American graduate but not for Foreign graduate. He said All FMG should pass step 3 and this is his/hospital policy.

Is this legitimate to make such difference between American graduate and Foreign graduate although we should comply to same rules and same contract without extra requirement or discrimination based on being AMG or IMG.

Pease advice, can you send me phone number to communicate directly.

Dr.A

Cell: 347-623-5406

"I would prefer to be unanimous"